

ETI Forum



FINAL
Report of ETI multi-
stakeholder seminar
on Colombia flower
industry

Bogotá, 18 April 2007

About ETI

ETI was formed in 1998 and is funded by membership fees and by a grant from the Department for International Development. ETI is an alliance of business, trade union and development and human rights organisations committed to working together to improve the lives of workers and their families that produce goods for the UK market. ETI's specific purpose is to identify and promote good practice in the implementation of corporate codes of conduct, including the monitoring and independent verification of such codes.

ETI's members want to ensure that the working conditions of employees in the companies that supply goods to consumers in the UK meet or exceed international labour standards. The special characteristics of ETI, and the reason it is well known internationally, are its tripartite structure and its focus on learning rather than certification of auditors or labelling of products or companies. This gives legitimacy to the lessons learned about the implementation and inspection of corporate codes of labour practice.

ETI is not an accreditation agency nor does it perform external audits. It exists in order to share experience and promote learning about implementing international labour standards in global supply chains.

About ETI Forum

ETI Forum reports on the key issues discussed at one of our events. ETI events – members' roundtables, public seminars and conferences – focus on ethical trade issues of topical interest or which have proved to be particularly challenging to our members. For example, we have held events on the role of gangmasters in the food and agricultural industry; the good and bad of audit practice and child labour in China. These events give members and others the opportunity to learn from guest speakers and from each other, and to debate practical responses to the issues raised.

Author: Pins Brown

Date: June 2007

Contents

1	List of organisations and their acronyms	4
2	Executive Summary	6
3	About this report	9
	3.1 <i>Who is this report for</i>	9
	3.2 <i>Purpose of this report</i>	9
4	Background and purpose of this event	9
	4.1 <i>ETI's capacity building work</i>	9
	4.2 <i>Why Colombia?</i>	9
	4.3 <i>What did this event aim to achieve</i>	10
5	Who participated	10
6	Why UK stakeholders are willing to work together in ETI	11
	6.1 <i>Why the UK Government supports ETI</i>	11
	6.2 <i>The corporate perspective: what ETI membership means to retailer and supplier company members</i>	11
	6.3 <i>The TU perspective: ethical trade and good practice in corporate social responsibility</i>	12
	6.4 <i>The NGO perspective: working with others from a rights-based approach</i>	13
7	ETI's experience in South Africa and Kenya	14
	7.1 <i>WIETA: example of successful multi-stakeholder work, social dialogue and credible social auditing</i>	14
	7.2 <i>Kenya flower industry: lessons on working together and participatory auditing</i>	15
8	Issues to be addressed on Colombian farms supplying UK	16
	8.1 <i>Overview</i>	16
	8.2 <i>Producer perspective</i>	16
	8.3 <i>Trade Union perspective</i>	17
	8.4 <i>NGO perspective</i>	18
	8.5 <i>ILO perspective</i>	19
9	Understanding how Colombian stakeholders can work together	19
	9.1 <i>Trade union response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue</i>	20
	9.2 <i>Company response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue</i>	20
	9.3 <i>NGO response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue</i>	22
	9.4 <i>International organisation response on their role, needs from other stakeholders and contribution to ongoing dialogue</i>	23
10	Co-chairs' conclusions and proposals	23
11	Next steps	24

1 Glossary of relevant organisations, their acronyms and websites

Trade unions

- IUF International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers' Associations, www.iuf.org
- CUT Central Unitaria de Trabajadores de Colombia
- CTC Central de Trabajadores de Colombia
- CGT Confederación General del Trabajo
- ISCOD Instituto Sindical de Cooperación al Desarrollo (solidarity organisation of the UGT, Spain)
- Sectoral Unions: Sinaltraflor, Sintrainagro, Untraflores, Utracun, Fetraboc,
- Enterprise-based unions: Flor America, Flores de los Andes, Flores Benilda, Flores de Funza, Flores el Rosal, Flores de la Sabana, Sintrasplendor,

Colombian NGOs

- ENS Escuela Nacional Sindical (National Trade Union School, www.ens.org.co)
- Cactus Corporación Cactus (www.cactus.org.co)
- Rainforest Alliance/Fundación Natura (www.natura.org.co)
- CCJ Colombian Commission of Jurists (www.coljuristas.org)
- DIAL Diálogo Interagencial (Network of Colombian Agencies; <http://dial.atarraya.org>)
- Alianza de Organizaciones Sociales (Civil Society Network)

International NGOs

- ETI Ethical Trading Initiative
- IOM International Organisation for Migration
- ILRF International Labour Rights Fund
- SAI Social Accountability international
- US LEAP US Labor Education in the Americas Project
- PADF Pan-American Development Foundation
- Christian Aid (www.christian-aid.org.uk)
- OGB Oxfam GB (www.oxfam.org.uk)
- WoW War on Want (www.waronwant.org)

Industry:

- ASOCOLFLORES Colombian flower producers association
- Pro-Export Colombian export promotion council

Foreign government

- FCO UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office
- US AID US Agency for International Development
- GTZ German agency for overseas development

2 Executive Summary

Background

ETI retailers and suppliers buy increasing volumes of flowers in Colombia. Since early 2003, relevant ETI members had been holding dialogue on the subject of the Colombian flower industry in the tripartite member group called the ETI Flower Forum. A delegation of Colombian trade unionists visited the UK in early 2006. While here, they met with ETI Flower Forum trade union and company members and suggested that ETI organise a multi-stakeholder seminar in Bogotá.

Aims of the seminar

This suggestion fitted perfectly with the aims of ETI's ongoing capacity-building programme. One of ETI's capacity-building objectives is to support suppliers to implement codes of conduct and help trade unions and NGOs play the role they wish to in these processes. As a result, in March 2006 ETI began work to organise a multi-stakeholder seminar in Bogotá with the following aims:

- Obtain greater commitment from commercial Colombian floriculture stakeholders to improving labour rights
- Communicate to Colombian stakeholders the importance of labour rights to UK business
- Create more space for trade unions and NGOs to work with producers, other stakeholders and together
- Share ETI lessons from South Africa and Kenya
- Generate greater understanding of good practice on labour rights implementation through codes of conduct.

Report of the seminar

The one-day seminar was held on 18 April 2007. It was very well attended: there were over 110 participants from a wide range of companies, trade unions and non-governmental organisations from Colombia, the UK and US. Also in attendance were representatives from multi-stakeholder initiatives, international organisations and the British Ambassador to Colombia.

ETI retailer, supplier, trade union and NGO members at the seminar made presentations about why they are members of ETI and why multi-stakeholder work in the Colombian flower industry is a priority for each of them. ETI members also shared their experience of addressing labour standards issues in the South African wine industry and the Kenyan flower industry. Relevant lessons were highlighted in two separate presentations. Colombian stakeholders representing producers, trade unions and NGOs as well as the ILO representative in Bogotá shared their perspectives on issues to be addressed in the Colombian flower industry.

There were two sessions of group work during which employers (retailers, importers/exporters and producers), trade unions, NGOs and international organisations discussed how to work together in future. This was broken down into:

- Defining a clear positive role for each set of stakeholders

- Considering what each group needed from the other stakeholders in order to work together in future
- Agreeing what each group can bring to an ongoing process to address labour issues.

The group work was very productive. While there were differences of opinion in all the groups, they each managed to reach consensus and make a joint response. Common ground included the need to:

- respect each others' roles and listen to each other seriously
- agree facts about the status of working conditions in the industry
- respect freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining
- establish a multi-stakeholder platform for ongoing dialogue
- build the floriculture industry in the context of respect for international labour standards.

Co-chairs' conclusions and proposals

Plenary sessions reported back what had been agreed by the groups. The seminar's co-chairs then summarised their understanding of what had been agreed by the different groups in order to present some conclusions and proposals for future work. Their conclusions, in full, are as follows:

- All stakeholder groups attending the Forum expressed their wish and political will to continue with a process of concerted dialogue in good faith and with mutual respect, respecting the different roles and competencies of the various groups.
- Social dialogue must be understood as a fundamental component to support growth, strengthening and success of the Colombian floricultural industry and ethical trade – also in recognition, among others, of the challenges related to the US dollar exchange rate.
- Stakeholder groups also recognise that respect for fundamental labour rights, in particular freedom of association and the effective right to collective bargaining for men and women workers and employers, as recognised in ILO conventions, is a fundamental component of dialogue and for promotion of decent work.
- Therefore: all stakeholder groups agree on the formation of a 'round table' for dialogue, with the participation of employers, unions and those NGOs linked to the floriculture sector, with technical assistance from the ILO and accompaniment by the ETI.

The co-chairs also made proposals regarding the round table based on ideas which emerged during the group work and the day as a whole. These were:

- that the convening participants for the round table be in the first instance Asocolflores, the IUF and a Colombian NGO (nominated by consensus by the group of Colombian NGOs that participated in the Forum), with the first meeting in July 2007
- to include the issue of continuous improvement on health and safety soon after the round table is initiated. This is because the necessity of continuous improvement of occupational health and safety in the sector, in order to improve and replicate existing good practices, as well as the challenges of protecting the environment, were issues of common concern.
- to include the elaboration of a baseline study to research the application of the ETI base code (and other elements agreed by the round table) as one of the first issues on the agenda. This is because of the different perspectives of the stakeholders and the

variety of statistics presented at the seminar. This study should be commissioned from a person or institution that has the confidence of all stakeholders, and who could be nominated by the ILO Office.

Next steps in Colombia and internationally

ETI will circulate this report widely and we hope that it provides a basis to start discussion by local stakeholders in Colombia. Between the seminar and the writing of this report in June 07, some stakeholders in Colombia have already been meeting.

ETI company, TU and NGO members will continue to work with their suppliers, affiliates and partners in Colombia to address issues raised at the seminar. Once local stakeholders have defined a process for going forward, we hope that all stakeholders can make the contributions outlined in Section 9 of this report. The ETI secretariat will encourage all members to support their local counterparts. We will also encourage our company members to take into account how their own purchasing practices impact on Colombian stakeholders' ability to improve labour standards. Finally, ETI will keep its website updated on any progress made.

3 About this report

3.1 Who is this report for

This report will primarily be of interest to flower industry stakeholders in the UK and Colombia, be they ETI members or beyond the membership; companies, trade unions or NGOs. It should also be of use for European and North American fair trade flower initiatives and labelling organisations. On a broader level it may be relevant reading for: Colombian suppliers to the UK and North America of other agricultural products such as coffee and bananas; flower industry stakeholders in other producing countries such as Kenya, Ecuador, Ethiopia; national and international multi-stakeholder initiatives. Finally, it may interest academics and consultants in the field of labour standards, ethical trade and social auditing.

3.2 Purpose of this report

This report will function as the official record of the ETI multistakeholder seminar held in Bogotá on 18 April 2007, both for those who attended and any other interested parties. It records the perspectives of different stakeholders and some of their suggestions for progressing labour rights in the flower industry. It does not endorse any of the participants' views or suggestions expressed, but simply reports them. This report will also share lessons from ETI's international experience of addressing labour rights in agriculture. We hope it can be used as a first step on which to base future dialogue between key stakeholders in Colombia.

4 Background and purpose of this event

4.1 ETI's capacity building work

This seminar was held as part of ETI's ongoing capacity-building programme. One of ETI's objectives is to develop greater capacity in supplier countries to make and sustain improvements in labour practices. Working through ETI members, their local offices, partners and affiliates, we believe that we have a role to play in encouraging multi-stakeholder partnerships and more collaborative approaches to resolving common problems. We are also well placed to facilitate exchanges between those engaged in code implementation work in different parts of the world.

ETI has engaged in a number of activities to develop local organisations' abilities to:

- identify and pursue sustainable solutions to specific, difficult labour rights issues
- build alliances and partnerships to tackle problems on a sectoral level
- identify and promote better ways to implement codes of labour practice in the local context.

4.2 Why Colombia?

ETI retailer and supplier members buy increasing volumes of flowers in Colombia. Since early 2003 relevant ETI members had been holding dialogue on the subject of the Colombian flower industry. This had involved discussions in the tripartite members working group called ETI Flower Forum; meetings with the Colombian flower producers' association (Asocoflores) and shared auditing of some Colombian flower suppliers by a non-ETI working group made up of retailers and suppliers.

In February 2006, a delegation of Colombian national centre trade unionists visited the UK as guests of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office. While here, they met with ETI trade union and company members to share information with regard to implementation of labour standards in Colombia. Colombian trade union participants at that meeting suggested that ETI organise a multi-stakeholder meeting in Bogotá. This suggestion was supported by the ETI Flower Forum and fitted perfectly with ETI's objective to support suppliers to implement codes of conduct and help trade unions and NGOs to play the role they wish to in these processes.

4.3 What did the event aim to achieve?

In keeping with ETI's capacity building objectives outlined above, the seminar aimed to:

- Obtain greater commitment from commercial Colombian floriculture stakeholders to improving labour rights
- Communicate to Colombian stakeholders the importance of labour rights to UK business
- Create more space for trade unions and NGOs to work with producers, other stakeholders and together
- Share ETI lessons from South Africa and Kenya
- Generate greater understanding of good practice on labour rights implementation through codes of conduct.

5 Who participated?

[To be placed in margin] *"In terms of the forum, it was a significant achievement to pull together the trade unions, NGOs and business representatives into one room."* NGO participant

There were over 110 participants from a wide range of companies and organisations at the seminar. The participants were predominantly Colombian but others included international organisations, multi-stakeholder organisations, a representative from the German agency for overseas development and the British Ambassador to Colombia.

ETI representatives from four member companies, Tesco, Marks & Spencer, Flamingo Holdings and World Flowers; two TU members, the British Trades Union Congress and the International Union of Foodworkers and one member NGO, Oxfam, were all involved. US stakeholders were also present in the form of Social Accountability International, the International Labour Rights Fund and the US Labor Education in the Americas Project. More than 40 trade unionists representing the IUF, all three national trade union centres, sectoral and enterprise level unions as well as representatives of a variety of Colombian NGOs were present.

The meeting was co-Chaired by: Simon Steyne in his capacity as a member of the ETI Board; Hector Fajardo, a former General Secretary of the CUT and now ISCOD representative in Colombia, and Steve Homer of Flamingo Holdings, a UK flower importer and ETI member. Simultaneous interpretation was provided.

6 Why UK stakeholders are willing to work together in ETI

In the opening session Pins Brown, Project Manager on Capacity Building at the Ethical Trading Initiative introduced the organisation, explaining that ETI members believe in a process of dialogue and working together to address labour rights issues. Members themselves addressed the seminar directly on why they work together in ETI.

6.1 Why the UK Government supports ETI

ETI is part-financed by the UK Government's Department for International Development. The UK 's Ambassador to Colombia, HE Mr Haydon Warren-Gash, opened the meeting by welcoming participants and explaining why the UK Government is supportive of the ETI approach generally, including our work in Colombia. He highlighted that the UK government encourages:

- the development of a functioning, free and constructive trade union movement in Colombia that will protect workers' rights
- the development of competitive industries, expansion of trade and increased economic growth to bring sustainable development and economic benefits to all in Colombia
- a process of dialogue to defend and promote workers' rights and to realise their responsibilities.

6.2 The corporate perspective: what ETI membership means to retailer and supplier company members

Louise Nicholls made a presentation on behalf of ETI's retailer members. She is the Foods Ethical Trade Manager for Marks & Spencer (a well-known UK supermarket), as well as a retailer representative on the ETI Board. Steve Homer, Commercial Manager of Flamingo Holdings, presented on behalf of ETI's horticulture supplier members. Flamingo Holdings is a large horticulture suppliers with operations in Kenya and South Africa. Both have been active in ETI for many years, and have visited Colombia a number of times over some years as part of their commercial roles and their ethical trade roles.

[To be placed in margin] *"It was interesting to hear a company describe moving from 'everything's fine on our farms, we're audited' to a position of listening to critics and realising 'we need to work together for continuous improvement'"* NGO participant

They each discussed what ETI membership has meant for their companies in general terms, and explained how membership of ETI has benefited them by providing:

- Practical guidance on what ethical trade means in practice
- A safe forum for debate
- Space to listen to a wide range of stakeholders
- Opportunity to learn from others
- Opportunity to develop contacts with relevant TUs and NGOs in the UK and abroad
- Chance to work collectively with other companies to strengthen impact
- 'Hands on' learning through experimental projects
- Learning on how to demonstrate their company's values in practice

- Ability to make real change and respond to critics with much better knowledge of situation in their own supply chains.

Issues of concern

Steve Homer also registered that worldwide on farms, his company is particularly concerned about contract labour¹, health and safety, excessive overtime and a voice for workers.

6.3 The TU perspective: ethical trade and good practice in corporate social responsibility

Sue Longley is the Agricultural Group Co-ordinator of the IUF. The IUF was a founder member of ETI and the IUF General Secretary was on the ETI Board from its foundation until February 2007. The IUF is the International Union of Food and Agricultural workers. It has 360 affiliates in 120 countries, and has negotiated international framework agreements negotiated directly with global companies such as Danone and Chiquita.

Sue's presentation explained that trade union organisations were members of ETI because:

- ETI's Base Code includes the fundamental ILO Conventions 87 and 98 on TU rights
- ETI has a tripartite structure, with trade unions, NGOs and companies equally represented
- ETI has excellent participation from UK supermarkets
- ETI has a good emphasis on agriculture and the rights of agriculture workers.

The IUF believes that working with codes of practice has brought progress for agricultural workers. In the ETI these have included legislation on gangmasters, union recognition in some ETI member companies and resolution of particular disputes between companies and trade unions.

Sue also focused on the trade union perspective on ethical trade, highlighting that:

- The best way of promoting and protecting workers' rights is through good labour law properly enforced and worker organisation in free, independent and democratic trade unions
- Universal human rights at work are the basis of the trade union approach, and trade union freedoms – freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining - are universal human rights recognised by the UN and the Colombian government (which has ratified ILO Conventions 87 and 98)
- Ethical trade is no replacement for either of those, and instead depends on market influence down international supply chains. However, it does have a role in:
 - Promoting in business a culture of conformity with good law
 - Opening space for social dialogue, and promoting trade union rights to association and collective bargaining and systems of mature industrial relations.

Furthermore, Sue stated that for codes of conduct to be credible, they need to be based on ILO Conventions, as a minimum those concerning fundamental rights at work; not be private code initiatives governed by one group of stakeholders; to be subject to credible inspection

¹ In Colombia this is sometimes called 'co-operative labour', and is provided through what are known as 'associated labour co-operatives'.

regimes; to be founded in social dialogue and accept that the best form of daily, worksite 'inspection' is to have trade unions on site.

What does an ethical business look like?

Finally, Sue's presentation also outlined what trade unions believe an ethical business looks like. For a company to behave ethically it needs to move beyond making declarations of intent to taking action. It should take its responsibilities as an employer seriously, providing decent and secure work, adopting an open attitude to trade unions and their activities, and respecting fundamental labour rights. Retailers need to ensure demands made of suppliers are supported with reasonable pricing policies and production/delivery schedules as well as long term contracts and investment. Mature industrial relations should also be encouraged, reaching agreements that allow success for the business alongside good working conditions for employees.

6.4 The NGO perspective: working with others from a rights-based approach

Thalia Kidder works at Oxfam GB as a Global Advisor on labour rights and gendered economics. Oxfam GB was also a founder member of ETI and promotes joint work between unions, NGOs and companies, respecting the distinctive and important role that each can play. Oxfam has worked on various ETI experimental projects including homeworkers in the UK and clothing workers in Asia.

In Oxfam's experience, to achieve and sustain improvements in labour rights, it is important to work with multiple actors. Oxfam works from a rights-based perspective, and promotes labour rights and women's rights as part of human rights. Oxfam seeks to strengthen the capacity of women and men workers to claim their rights, requiring from public institutions and the private sector that rights are respected and promoted. Oxfam believes that the private sector can promote sustainable development, economic growth and decent employment, however too often the focus is only on profitability without addressing gender equality and poverty reduction. Oxfam's strategies include work with companies so that the private sector's contribution to development can be positive and respect human rights.

Oxfam supports work in 70 countries around the world with the Livelihoods Programme, research and campaigns. The Make Trade Fair campaign has highlighted the impact of international trade on women's labour rights. Oxfam has done research and advocacy international trade agreements, national labour legislation, global companies' purchasing practices and the impacts of these on making employment more precarious, especially for women workers at the bottom of global trading chains.

The Oxfam GB programme in Colombia works with trade union and NGO partners, supporting the Alliance 'Make Trade Fair: my rights are not negotiable' campaign. Oxfam GB's programme in Colombia has also conducted research on the export fruit and flower industries. This research emphasised that the flexibilisation of labour has hidden costs for workers, industry and society, including the recent labour reform that has resulted in more work and lower remuneration for women workers.

Oxfam GB also believes that ETI company members need to integrate labour rights into the heart of their business practices. They need to change the way they do business and how their buyers negotiate with suppliers. In many cases, it is a 'leadership group' of companies in an industry that change the status quo and show that it is possible to be ethical and be

competitive. Furthermore, a collective response by all actors in an industry – in this case the flower industry – is most effective in order to raise supply chain standards.

7. ETI's experience in South Africa and Kenya

ETI and its members wanted to share experience of addressing labour standards issues in the wine industry in South Africa and in the flower industry in Kenya so that any relevant lessons could be passed on to Colombian stakeholders.

7.1 WIETA: example of successful multi-stakeholder work, social dialogue and credible social auditing²

Simon Steyne is the Senior International Officer of the British Trades Union Congress, an elected worker member of the ILO Governing Body and represents the TUC on the ETI Board. He was Chair of ETI's experimental project in South Africa (1998 – 2001). That project led to the foundation of the Wine and Agriculture Industry Ethical Trade Association (WIETA) in 2002. He presented the lessons learned from that project and the foundation of WIETA and drew attention to some parallels and differences with Colombia.

Origins of the Project

The project originated in discussions with the tripartite South African representatives in the ILO Governing Body. It was chosen because of market leverage in a relatively small and transparent supply chain, shared commitment to supporting the new South Africa and the need to develop and test credible methods of social auditing. All ETI participants had partners in South Africa, and the ETI Code and national legislation were complementary.

Initial problems and developments

Problems in the sector included violations of labour rights, poor wages, working conditions, housing, occupational safety and health and public health and education. Discrimination and paternalism were barriers to sustainable improvement. Early improvements included the rights of women workers to work outside the vineyard in which their husbands were employed; provision of written contracts; establishment of unemployment funds; an end to part-payment in wine and to child labour and construction of new worker housing. Workers' voices were heard for the first time and employers began to cooperate with inspection teams.

Development of multistakeholder inspection teams

Several waves of inspections between 1999 and 2001 developed multi-stakeholder inspection teams and good inspection methodology, which delivered high quality reports. Key lessons were the importance of local skills and knowledge, especially from local trade unions; good inspection techniques, timing, triangulation of evidence and gender sensitivity. The Ethical Trade Forum of South Africa was established in 1999 as an ETI partner.

The establishment of WIETA and its role

Partnership supported both credible social auditing and real improvements. UK supermarkets supported the extension of this methodology and in October 2002 local stakeholders established the Wine Industry Ethical Trade Association of South Africa (WIETA) to roll out the work in the wine sector and beyond. WIETA is governed by an executive committee of company, trade union and NGO representatives with an observer from the Labour Ministry.

² Free copies of the full ETI project report *Inspecting labour practice in the wine industry of the Western Cape, South Africa* ETI, 2004, can be ordered at <http://www.ethicaltrade.org/Zlib/2004/02/sawine-rept/index.shtml>

The first chair was from the companies, the current chair is a trade union official. A labour inspector was also on the accreditation committee. WIETA trains independent social auditors; workers and employers are present when inspections begin and the results and recommendations are also reported to management and to worker representatives. Improvements are pursued in consultation with management and unions.

Cost effectiveness and results

The new system was cost effective and supported in part by the return of the EU import duty rebate to WIETA and other social development projects following the new trade agreement with South Africa. WIETA also promotes social dialogue – it had become an unofficial body for sectoral negotiation: there are more workers in unions and more collective agreements and better inter-union cooperation; both workers and employers are benefiting. Cooperation between WIETA and the labour inspectorate promotes a culture of conformity with the law among employers and there is strong support from government.

7.2 Kenya flower industry: lessons on working together and participatory auditing³

Margaret Nderitu is the Ethical Manager at World Flowers. World Flowers is a major UK supplier, sourcing flowers from all over the world, with special arrangements from Kenya. She shared her experience of working within her company and the ETI Flower Forum to address issues in the Kenyan flower industry.

How did members work together?

This work began in 2002 when an ETI member NGO complained to corporate ETI members about poor working conditions in the industry. All of ETI's retailer members source flowers in Kenya (just as they do in Colombia), so a collective response was required. As a result, the tripartite ETI Flower Forum was formed for members to share information and good practice and work jointly with partners in Kenya. In Kenya, industry, government and NGO stakeholders came together to form the Horticultural Ethical Business Initiative (HEBI), though there was no union representation in HEBI. World Flowers was heavily involved at both ends with its own source farms part of the pilot audit process and a collective bargaining agreement now in place on its largest source farm.

Moving to participatory auditing

Several different codes already existed in Kenya at the time this work began, including industry standards and fair trade standards. However, the social auditing which was being used to assess conditions in the industry was not generating accurate information. Private bodies were conducting 'snapshot' audits using their own auditors, not using participatory auditing methods and with no involvement of TUs or NGOs. Following the sharing of learning from earlier ETI work in Zimbabwe and South Africa, Kenyan stakeholders developed their own participatory auditing methodology. The benefits of participatory auditing included:

- Increased worker involvement and education instead of a focus on non-compliances
- Greater understanding of sensitive issues such as harassment or discrimination which are difficult to uncover from documents or formal questioning

³ Full report of this work *Addressing labour practices on Kenyan Flower farms: report of ETI involvement 2002-2004* can be downloaded in English and Spanish from <http://www.ethicaltrade.org/Z/lib/2005/02/rept-kenyaflws/index.shtml>

- Enables discussion between workers and employers to share ideas about labour and social issues.

Achievements of stakeholders in the UK and Kenya

- Creation of safe space for discussion to address common problems through the ETI Flower Forum in the UK, and HEBI in Kenya
- Appropriate audit criteria and participatory auditing developed and a pool of local auditors trained
- All stakeholders had an increased awareness of social codes
- Lessons from improving social auditing and stakeholder work in Zimbabwe and South Africa shared.

Particular lessons relevant for Colombian stakeholders

Margaret stated that a number of lessons learned from the experience were relevant for Colombian stakeholders. They include the fact that all stakeholders need to co-operate to ensure good labour practices. With regard to social auditing, stakeholder involvement builds confidence, generates ownership of the process and more in-depth information as well as acceptance of the findings. While the costs of conducting audits were borne by the companies involved, using trained, local auditors was much cheaper than international auditors. It is important for the gender of auditors to reflect the gender balance of workers so that male and female workers can both express their concerns. Having an audit process which is understood by workers is also essential. Finally, an approach of continuous improvement of working conditions on the farms is preferable to a compliance approach – there are no quick fixes.

8. Issues to be addressed on Colombian farms supplying the UK

8.1 Overview

At the seminar, four different Colombian stakeholders gave their perspectives on the issues to be addressed on farms supplying the UK. Asocolflores spoke on behalf of the flower producers, Cactus for the Colombian NGOs and Untraflores for the Colombian trade unions. Many of these perspectives show very different views of the current working conditions for employees in the flower industry. As a result, this document will report the views of each stakeholder as presented at the seminar. The director of the new ILO office in Bogotá also gave a view from the ILO perspective.

8.2 Producer perspective

Asocolflores' President, Augusto Solano, made a presentation on behalf of his members. His members' produce represent 75% of Colombia's total flower exports. He stated that Asocolflores aims to work for a sustainable flower industry, underpinned by social responsibility. He introduced Asocolflores' social and environmental label, Florverde, which has been running for over 10 years. It is a voluntary code of conduct which promotes workers' wellbeing as well as sustainable floriculture, and it is certified by Swiss audit firm SGS. Asocolflores' members hectareage covered by Florverde has grown significantly, and 109 farms have now been certified to the Florverde standard. It emphasises compliance with

labour and health and safety law. He also stated that 13% of workers are members of trade unions, with nearly 26% covered by collective bargaining agreements.

Conditions on farms under the Florverde scheme

The Florverde scheme has led to significant improvements in working conditions on farms.

All Florverde farms have the following features:

- Total coverage of social security entitlements
- All workers are over 18 years of age
- Work contracts are formal
- OH&S training
- Minimum legal wage or higher
- Full provision of working clothes and equipment
- Permanent medical assistance
- Drinking water available to all workers
- Canteens and food heating facilities
- Rest rooms and changing rooms
- Chemical and ergonomic risk-prevention programs
- Socio-demographic diagnoses and social programs

75% of Asocolflores farms pay over the minimum wage. Farms have breaks for workers and the average working week is 46.5 hours. Overtime is paid at varying differentials according to time of day and day of the week. While discrimination is not defined in the Florverde code, there are opportunities for women and there is no racial discrimination. Regular employment is provided and the average length of service for workers is six years. In addition there are other successful social development programmes conducted by Asocolflores. Areas for improvement include housing for workers and environmentally friendly floriculture.

Problems facing the industry

There are also problems facing the industry. These include the revaluation of the Colombian peso, unprecedented frosts earlier in the year, decreasing demand for flowers in world markets and increasing costs per worker. Unemployment is at 12%, and Asocolflores fears that discouraging consumers to buy Colombian flowers will lead to more job losses.

8.3 Trade Union perspective

Alejandro Torres, president of Untraflores, presented the trade union perspective with the agreement of the IUF and the CUT.

Situation for flower industry workers

He stated that the flower industry was a major contributor to Colombia's export earnings. Nevertheless, there are many irresponsible practices in the flower industry. Working conditions are worsening, with salaries often low and workers unable to earn a living wage. The work itself is hard. Some flower farms are closing without employees being paid the correct severance pay. There are also serious health and safety issues, with pesticides causing lifelong problems including for reproductive health.

TU rights

There has been little change in the flower industry regarding freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining. They are still not properly recognised by the government or employers, and there are campaigns to prevent freedom of association, including the use of 'pactos colectivos' imposed unilaterally by employers [keep Spanish term in English version]. Many employers use various different types of temporary workers, and this is a

deliberate strategy to avoid worker access to trade union rights. What workers want is decent work and access to their trade union rights. They want to end the use of temporary contracts, sub-contracting relationships and the use of contracts for services through 'associated labour co-operatives'.

Environmental concerns

Alejandro closed his presentation by stating that there are also environmental concerns. Aside from pesticide issues, local municipalities have in some cases been making complaints about the flower industry's use and impact on surface and ground water.

Sinaltraflor and Utracun

Following the seminar, a letter was received from Sinaltraflor and Utracun which stressed that these unions had been able to build strong membership and negotiate collective agreements in 24 fincas covering 6000 workers.

8.4 NGO perspective

Aura Rodriguez, Executive Director of Corporación Cactus gave a presentation with the NGO perspective. She welcomed the interest of ETI in this important sector so that all stakeholders can make a balanced assessment of strategies to support workers' rights. She stated that the welfare of both men and women workers should be the highest indicator of success in this sector. This calls for the recognition of their rights as stipulated in ILO conventions and Colombian law.

Aura described how Cactus has worked in the sector for over 10 years, supporting democratic union organization and gathering evidence. Cactus' Legal Advice Department has dealt with 600 cases in six years and has conducted over 3000 interviews with workers between 2004 and 2007. This work has gathered evidence that women and men workers in the flower industry face significant problems in exercising their fundamental rights. So far there have not been assassinations of union leaders in this sector, and it is important to prevent this type of violence by respecting democratic union organization. These problems include:

- **obstacles to freedom of association**, through the open promotion, for example, of unions formed by the companies (the so called *sindicatos patronales*) or incentives to disaffiliate from unions.
- **long working hours** that can reach 14 to 16 hours in the peak season. For women there will be a further three or four hours of domestic work.
- **discrimination against women**, in the form of pregnancy tests (reported by 84% of women interviewed in 2005); dismissals during pregnancy (5% of the cases treated by Cactus' Legal Advice), and questions on the current and expected number of children. Women currently represent 65% of the workforce and 77% of the field and post-harvest workers; men are more highly represented in managerial positions.
- **health and safety hazards**, such as repetitive strain injuries like carpal tunnel syndrome, uncomfortable postures, exposure to chemicals and temperature change. Workers recognise improvements with Florverde, although the World Health Organisation's recommendation of leaving 24 hours between the time flowers are sprayed and workers re-enter the area is still frequently not respected.
- **Minimum salaries below living wage**. The monthly national minimum wage is \$433.70 which only represents 45% of basic family living costs (or *Canasta Familiar Básica*, CFB). In addition, the main reason why workers seek advice with

Cactus is the delays in payments of salaries and benefits at the end of a contract. This contradicts the minimum living income ('mínimo vital'), recognised in Colombian law, as this is the only source of income for workers.

- **Insufficient rest times**, which together with long hours increase health and safety risks.
- Direct open-ended employment which enables workers to exercise their labour rights has been threatened by changes in the Colombian Law and business practices. For example Cactus research finds that 18.1% of employment is provided by temporary employment agencies, and 2.9% by worker cooperatives (*cooperativas de trabajo asociado*), which is forbidden by law.
- **Lack of workers' participation in social audits** and in Florverde. In auditing, workers' participation may be managed by companies. In the Florverde code, forms of organization do not sufficiently distinguish between democratic unions and others such as health and safety committees. In addition, audits do not include questions to determine the level of union democracy.
- **Non-payment of health and social security benefits** is a frequent complaint from workers in the sector.

In conclusion, the UK market and the ETI offer significant opportunities for Colombian employers to strengthen their commitment to labour legislation and promote practices beyond legal requirements. In a framework of dialogue with women and men workers, this can lead to a better redistribution of the benefits if it involves decent salaries, secure jobs, freedom of association, reduced working hours, open worker participation in codes and monitoring systems and a recognition of a differentiated impact of labour conditions on women workers' exercise of their rights.

8.5 ILO perspective

The ETI was very grateful to have the attendance of Marcelo Castro Fox, Director of the recently established ILO office in Colombia. Marcelo made a presentation expressing the ILO support for the seminar and its aims, which are consistent with those of the ILO. He reminded participants that the ILO is tripartite and represents its government, employer and trade union members. He was pleased by the large number of participants. He encouraged all participants to use the opportunity of group work sessions to work together constructively and build on the day to work together in future. He promised to help support any ongoing dialogue as a result of the seminar.

9. Understanding how Colombian stakeholders can work together

During the seminar there were two sessions of group work during which employers, NGOs, TUs and international organisations discussed how to work together in future. In particular, this was broken down into the following:

- Defining a clear positive role for each set of stakeholders
- Considering what each group needed from the other stakeholders in order to work together in future
- Agreeing what each group can bring to an ongoing process to address labour issues.

While there were differences of opinion in all the groups, they each managed to reach consensus and make a joint response. Common ground included the need to:

- respect each others' roles and listen to each other seriously
- agree facts about the status of working conditions in the industry
- respect freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining
- establish a platform for ongoing dialogue
- build the floriculture industry in the context of respect for international labour standards.

Each group presented the results of its discussions in plenary sessions at the seminar, and submitted its notes from these discussions to the ETI. These are reported below.

9.1 Trade union response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue

[to be placed in margin]: *“Bringing all parties together was a challenge and the IUF played an outstanding role in coordinating the union side. The round table is a great achievement - forum participants were prepared to listen to each other and are carrying on talking. More space for mature industrial relations in the flower sector will be good for workers and for the industry as a whole. The more effective social dialogue we have in Colombia the better”. Trade union participant*

The trade union group was very well represented with 40 representatives from: the IUF, CUT, CUT Antioquia, CUT Cundimarca, CTC, CGT, Sintrainagro, Utracun, Sinaltraflor, Untraflores, Fetraboc, Flor America, Flores de los Andes, Flores Benilda, Flores de Funza, Flores el Rosal, Flores de la Sabana, CI Spendor, Sintraandes, , Sinflocor, , Sintrario, and ENS. The trade union group reached consensus and made the following proposals:

- To establish a platform of ongoing dialogue, participation and agreement based on and governed by the principle of mutual respect
- To establish a roundtable for dialogue purposes, with the participation of trade unions, employers and NGOs in the flower industry, with the technical assistance of the ILO and the accompaniment of the ETI. They agreed that the IUF would coordinate trade union input into the roundtable
- To build mutual trust through the political will expressed with regard to the right to freedom of association, decent and ethical work and collective bargaining as defined by the international conventions of the ILO
- We share the desire to strengthen businesses which are competitive in the context of respect for trade union and social rights with a view to expanding business to the European Union including emphasis on the UK market.
- To jointly develop mechanisms to protect the environment in the widest sense.

9.2 Company response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue

The corporate group was made up of UK retailers and suppliers, Colombian producers and agents as well as representatives of Asocolflores and Proexport.

Positive role for companies

The companies stated that they are interested in the welfare and development of flower workers, as demonstrated by the large numbers attending and actively participating in the seminar.

What companies need from other stakeholders

The companies agreed that ongoing dialogue can be achieved if all parties respect the following:

- Agreement on expected behaviour:
 - no generalisations
 - following the rules of the event and any rules agreed in the future
 - being prepared to listen, not only passively to what others say, but to really hear what they are saying in the way that you too would wish to be heard
 - Refrain from singling out any particular person or institution participating by making damaging remarks against them.

Furthermore, the companies felt that it is a priority to build trust. As a result they recommend commissioning a base line study in which the parties agree on the current state of the industry in those issues of common interest. The study should be based on data, facts and valid sources. In order to help build the necessary trust, all parties must begin by accepting other parties and taking into consideration their contributions. The companies stated that they accept freedom of association but not the obligation to associate. When it is an obligation there is no freedom. They also feel it is important to emphasize positive examples in which, for example, freedom of association in any of its expressions is reflected as a model of strengthened communication.

Companies' proposals for ongoing dialogue

The companies made very concrete proposals for a roundtable as a process of ongoing dialogue, with an accompanying timetable. These were:

- To agree to exchange information in an adequate space and with an independent facilitator.
- For each of the three groups to define two representatives, for a total of six people at the roundtable.
- That the first meeting be held on 13 July 2007. Its purpose will be to define the type of information to be discussed, as well as the rules of the roundtable.
- For the three groups to give their information to an independent third party responsible for consolidating the information in order to compare and analyse it, by 7 September 2007.
- That the roundtable should meet again in November in order to discuss the information and for all parties to reach agreement resulting in a base line diagnosis of the sector. The independent third party should submit the information to each group before the meeting to allow preparation time.
- That the group accepts the generous proposal of the international governmental and non-governmental related to funding for the roundtable.

9.3 NGO response on their role, needs from other stakeholders, contribution and proposals for ongoing dialogue

The NGO group was made up of Cactus, War on Want, Oxfam GB, Rainforest Alliance, Fundacion Ideas por la Paz, International Labour Rights Fund, US Labour Education in the Americas Project and Escuela Nacional Sindical.

Positive role for NGOs

The group recognised that national and international NGOs play different roles. The group wished to express the important fundamental point that companies should not expect NGOs to represent unions' views: NGOs do not substitute for nor represent unions, (or companies: for example, employers' associations may also be classified as NGOs). The group considered that potential positive roles and contributions by NGOs included:

- Research, documentation and evidence about the flower industry and labour conditions.
- Promotion of spaces for meeting and dialogue
- Promoting communication strategies to raise awareness (change beliefs), including with consumers
- To promote links with local and national authorities and with consumer groups.
- To support building alternatives – approaches, strategies and models – based on learning from other experiences
- To contribute analysis of gender (in)equality, environmental impact, social impact and production and distribution chains.

What NGOs need from other stakeholders

In considering what NGOs need from other actors, the group divided their response into three parts: what is needed from both (all) groups; what is needed from companies and what is needed from trade unions.

Needed from both (all) groups	Needed from companies	Needed from unions
To listen to each other		
To come to agreement about each of our roles in the process	To communicate their commitment to respect the rights of women and men workers on the farms	To clarify the structure, process and linkages of global and national unions
To recognise the specific needs of and obstacles faced by women		
To agree indicators that will be the basis for our joint work	Better information provided, transparency and openness	
To know about other (MSI) experiences, eg the roles taken on by TUs, NGOs and companies		
To clarify expectations about the process		

NGO proposals for ongoing dialogue

In the second group work session, the NGO group reflected on the feedback from other groups and came to the following proposals:

- With regard to ‘promoting spaces for dialogue’, to support the proposed ‘Mesa de Diálogo’ with Trade Unions, companies and NGOs. The group proposed that the ILO be involved and that technical support be requested from the ETI for this Roundtable.
- That the roundtable develops basic agreements on what is non-negotiable, including the values and principles for the dialogue. This would start with the ILO Core Labour Standards and the ILO concept of ‘Decent Work’ as non-negotiable.
- That the roundtable should have a clear process to agree the terms of reference for new research (study) which would define a base line of common, agreed information about conditions in the flower industry.
- That NGOs involved in the roundtable would be national NGOs with a clear track record of working on labour standards in the flower industry. The NGO group proposed meeting to arrive at agreements between NGOs about the NGO representation in the meeting.
- That the roundtable address the issues of financing (and any others) to create the conditions for real participation and sustainability of the roundtable.

9.4 International governmental and non-governmental organisations’ response on their role, requirements and contribution to ongoing dialogue

The international organizations and observers present in this group were Social Accountability International, Ethical Trading Initiative, the International Organisation for Migration and US AID. They felt that they could play a positive role and contribute to ongoing dialogue by:

- Contributing resources, for example neutral meeting space, staff time and funding (where this is not controversial)
- Helping establish minimum goals and common ground
- Supporting sustainable competitiveness alongside decent work and international labour standards
- Helping build capacity of different stakeholders
- Helping to involve governments, labour inspectors, NGOs, IGOs and UN agencies such as the ILO, building on the traditional partners in social dialogue (trade unions and employers)
- Helping to build local ownership and ensure primacy of local perspectives
- Adding global perspectives.

10. Co-chairs conclusions and proposals

At the end of the group work and plenary sessions, the co-chairs summarised their understanding of what had been expressed by the different groups. This was in order to draw and present some resulting Chair’s conclusions and proposals for future work. Though explained to participants at the outset of the seminar, unfortunately this process was unclear to some participants on the day. In presenting a record of the conclusions and proposals here, we have consulted the groups’ own records of their discussions, and tried to draw as accurately as possible on what emerged from those.

10.1 Conclusions of the co-chairs

- All stakeholder groups attending the Forum expressed their wish and political will to continue with a process of concerted dialogue in good faith and with mutual respect, respecting the different roles and competencies of the various groups.

- Social dialogue must be understood as a fundamental component to support growth, strengthening and success of the Colombian floricultural industry and ethical trade – also in recognition, among others, of the challenges related to the US dollar exchange rate.
- Stakeholder groups also recognise that respect for fundamental labour rights, in particular freedom of association and the effective right to collective bargaining for men and women workers and employers, as recognised in ILO conventions, is a fundamental component of the dialogue and for promotion of decent work.
- Therefore: all stakeholder groups agree on the formation of a “Round Table” for dialogue, with the participation of employers, unions and those NGOs linked to the floriculture sector, with technical assistance from the ILO and accompaniment by the ETI.

10.2 Proposals of the co-chairs which emerged from the discussions

- The Forum proposes that the convening participants for the Round Table be in the first instance Asocolflores, the IUF and a Colombian NGO (nominated by consensus by the group of Colombian NGOs that participated in the Forum)
- The Forum proposes that the first meeting be in July.
- Issues of common concern include the necessity of a continuous improvement of occupational health and safety in the sector, in order to improve and replicate existing good practices; as well as the challenges of protecting the environment. Therefore, among several proposals of the Forum is that of including this issue in the agenda soon after the Round Table is initiated.
- As a result of the different perspectives of the different stakeholders, as well as the variety of statistics presented, the Forum also proposes to include as one of the first issues on the agenda of the Roundtable in September, the elaboration of a baseline study to research the application of the ETI base code (and other elements agreed by the Roundtable). This should be commissioned from a person or institution that has the confidence of all stakeholders, and who could be proposed by the ILO Office.

11. Next steps

This report will be widely circulated and should provide a basis to start discussion by local stakeholders in Colombia. Between the seminar in April 07 and the writing of this report in June 07, stakeholders in Colombia have already been meeting. The IUF local office has agreed to co-ordinate the trade union contribution. Colleagues from the CUT have also met with NGO colleagues in Bogotá. The TUC has made a financial contribution to the reestablished ILO office in Bogotá, and this is to be used for worker training in coordination with the IUF and ENS.

ETI company, TU and NGO members will continue to work with their suppliers, affiliates and partners in Colombia to address issues raised at the seminar. Once local stakeholders have defined a process for going forward, we hope that all stakeholders – Colombian, UK and international - can make the contributions outlined in Section 9 of this report. The ETI secretariat will encourage all members to support their local counterparts. We will also encourage our company members to take into account how their own purchasing practices impact on Colombian stakeholders’ ability to improve labour standards. ETI will keep its website updated on any progress made.

Appendix 1: Seminar Agenda

Agenda: ETI multi-stakeholder seminar on implementing labour rights in the Colombian flower industry

Hotel Rosales Plaza, Calle 71a, No 5-47 18 April 2007

Time	Activity	Speaker
08.30	Registration, coffee	
09.00	Introduction to the seminar	Chairs: Hector Fajardo, Simon Steyne
Session 1: Introducing UK stakeholders and their perspectives		
09.10	Welcome from British Ambassador to Colombia	Haydon Warren-Gash
09.25	What is ETI?	Pins Brown, ETI
09.35	Why are we working together in ETI and in Colombia Speakers from companies, TUs and NGOs	Louise Nicholls, Marks & Spencer (retailer) Steve Homer, Flamingo Holdings (importer) Sue Longley, IUF Thalia Kidder, Oxfam
Session 2: Introducing Colombian stakeholders and their perspectives		
10.20	Introduction to the session	Hector Fajardo
10.30	Issues to be addressed on flower farms supplying UK Perspectives from representatives of producers, TUs, NGOs and ILO	Asocolflores (representing producers) TUs - representatives to be confirmed Cactus (NGOs) ILO – Marcelo Castro Fox
Session 3: What roles can each stakeholder play to encourage working together		
11.15	Introduction to the session	Simon Steyne
11.25	Break into groups Producers, TUs, NGOs and international stakeholders to agree: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - What positive role can each play - What would each need from others in order to work together going forward 	
12.30	LUNCH	
13.35	Report back from group work	
Session 4: Learning from ETI's experience		
14.05	Introduction to the session	Pins Brown, ETI
14.10	Wine industry, South Africa Flower industry	Simon Steyne Margaret Nderitu, World Flowers
Session 5: What can stakeholders bring to a process of working together?		
15.05	Introduction to the session	Hector Fajardo
15.15	Break into groups Stakeholders to agree what each can bring to an ongoing process to address labour issues (with reference to what others would need from them as discussed in Session 3)	
16.20	Return to plenary	
16.25	Stakeholders report results of Session 5 to plenary	
Session 6: Next steps		
17.00	Proposal for next steps based on results of group work	Chairs
17.20	Conclusion	Chairs and ETI delegation

Appendix 2: List of participants and observers

Participants

Organisation name	Name
Agricola Conday	Rafael Gutierrez
All Seasons	Carlos Campos
All Seasons	Farrah Adam
Alpes Flowers	Peter Beyfus
Alpes Flowers	Katheryn Mejia
Americaflor	Jorge Lopez
Aposentos	Felipe Ramirez
Aposentos	Angela Maria Catumba
Asesora seguridad social	Patricia Martinez
ASOCOLFLORES	Juan Carlos Isaza
ASOCOLFLORES	Augusto Solano
ASOCOLFLORES	Martha Moreno
BC Bromelias	Franz Georg Gruber
Benilda	Adriana Gonzalez
Benilda	Luisa Monroy
Benilda	Pedro T Mejia
Cactus	Loriz Saenz
Cactus	Angelica Chaparro
Cactus	Aura Rodriquez
CGT/Fetraboc	Julio Roberto Gomez
CGT/Fetraboc	Luis E Medina
CGT/Fetraboc	Cervulo Bautista
CGT/Fetraboc	Nelson Caballero
CGT/Fetraboc	Humberto Correa
CGT/Fetraboc	Jose Andres Pena
CGT/Fetraboc	Humberto Prado
CGT/Fetraboc - Benilda	Judith Ospina
CGT/Fetraboc - Benilda	Daniel Castro
CGT/Fetraboc - Benilda	Carmen Fuentes
CGT/Fetraboc - Benilda	Bertha Usaquen
CGT/Fetraboc - Flores de los Andes	Jose Castillo

CGT/Fetraboc - Flores de los Andes	Martha Cecilia Gomez
CGT/Fetraboc - Flores de los Andes	Gloria Cardenas
CGT/Fetraboc - Flores de los Andes	Ana Cante
CGT/Fetraboc - Flores de los Andes	Aminta Rogeles
CGT/Fetraboc - La Sabana	Gonzalo Santamaria
Colibri	Maria Fernanda Rojas
Colibri	Andres Toro
CTC	Gonzalo Wohmeyer
CTC	Gomez
CTC	Carlos Torres
CUT	Manuel Tellez
CUT Antiquioa	Jose Juaquin Vasquez
CUT/Fiscal	Tarsicio Mora Godoy
Deutsche Gesellschaft für technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ)	Peter Hauschnik
Discovery	Martha Nieto
Discovery	Fernando Yanez
ENS	Jana Silverman
ENS	Marta Cecilia Londoño
Flamingo Holdings	Steve Homer
Flores Colombianos	Uriel Perez
Flores De Bojaca	Peida Ramir de Ramirez
Flores de Funza	Alvaro Ferro
Flores de Funza	Luz Angela Tobar
Flores de Funza	Sergio Cadena
Flores del Rio	Maria Carmen Alargan
Flores la Conchita	Maria Eugenia Aleman
Foreign and Commonwealth Office	Haydon Warren-Gash
Foreign and Commonwealth Office	Alice Carver
Grupo Capiro	Marisa Silva
Grupo Chia	Piedad Villaneda
Grupo Chia	Catalina Casas
Grupo Chia	Felipe Arango
Hosa Ltd	Mauricio Morales
Intergreen	Maarten Moerman
Intergreen	Jan Willem van Gulik

Intergreen	Jose Henao
International Labour Rights Fund	Nora Ferm
International Union Foodworkers	Sue Longley
International Union Foodworkers	Luis Pedraza
Jardines de los Andes	Fernando Jaramillo
Marks & Spencer	Louise Nicholls
Multiflora	Daniel Urbina
Oxfam	Thalia Kidder
Oxfam GB Colombia	Clare ?
Oxfam GB Colombia	Andres Bernal
Oxfam GB Colombia	Pilar Rueda
Oxfam GB Colombia	Laura Rangel
ProExport	Alejandra Bejarano
SGP	Lucy Emmott
Sinaltraflor	Pablo Osario
Sinaltraflor (Funza)	Ana Lucia Rojas
Sinaltraflor (Funza)	Alvaro Castillo
SINTRAINAGRO	Hernan Correa
Suasunque	Ernesto Velez
Suasunque	Lucy de Velez
Suasunque	Erika Avila
Tahami Cultiflores	Elizabeth Londono
Tesco	David Fryer
Trades Union Congress	Simon Steyne
Untraflores	Gloria Romero
Untraflores	Aide Silva
Untraflores	Alejandro Torres
Untraflores	Edwin Ramirez
US Labour Education in the Americas Project (LEAP)	Stephen Coates
US Labour Education in the Americas Project (LEAP)	Charity Ryerson
Utracun	Manuel Salamanco
Utracun	Maria del Carmen Alarcon
Utracun	Alejandro Ramirez
Utracun/Sinaltraflor	William Blanco Gomez

Utracun/Sinaltraflor
Utracun/Sinaltraflor - Splendor Rosal
Utracun/Sinaltraflor - Splendor Rosal
World Flowers

Humberto Montero
Ruth Cardenas
Eduardo Palacios
Margaret Nderitu

Observers

Fundacion Ideas para la Paz
Fundacion Natura
FUPAD
International Organisation for Migration
Ethical Trading Initiative
Organización Internacional del Trabajo
Social Accountability International (SAI)
US AID
US Department of State
War on Want
War on Want

Alexandra Guaqueta
Elsa Martinez Escobar
John Heard
Patricia Tinoco
Pins Brown
Marcelo Castro Fox
Elena Arengo
Cara Thanassi
Adam Lewert
Paul Moon
Simon McRae